

**Whitewater Township Board
Minutes of Regular Meeting held July 14, 2015**

Call to Order/Pledge of Allegiance

Supervisor Popp called the meeting to order at 7:02 p.m. at the Whitewater Township Hall, 5777 Vinton Road, Williamsburg, Michigan, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

Roll Call of Board Members

Board Members present: Benak, Goss, Hubbell, Lawson, Popp

Board Members absent: None

Others present: County Commissioner Carol Crawford, Ambulance Coordinator Dawn Martin, Frederic Township Fire Department Deputy Chief Ed Goscicki, Mobile Medical Response Director of Operations Matt Holtcamp, and 11 others

Set/Adjust Meeting Agenda

No adjustments.

Declaration of Conflict of Interest

None

Public Comment

Marc McKellar, Grand Traverse County Road Commission, gave the following report:

- LaFranier Road is now open. South Airport is under construction at the intersection.
- The millage projects should be wrapped up on schedule and within budget. They are looking at projects for 2016.
- Baggs Road is still of interest to the Road Commission and they are concerned that it is not in the condition that they would like to have had it maintained. The GTCRC cannot do anything as the leader, but the Kalkaska County Road Commission could come in with a plan with Clearwater Township. They have seen the letters from the attorneys. MDOT's response is that they have seen worse roads, it is passable, slow down, take care of the drainage issues. GTCRC and Whitewater Township should not be discounted in the conversation. They are looking for more money coming from Lansing. If it comes, and if Kalkaska would want to do an engineered plan, the GTCRC would be willing to talk about it in a noncontroversial manner.
- They will have a labor agreement shortly and will start their budget process in August. Regarding the GASB 68 ruling, the Road Commission has \$3 million of unfunded pension liabilities. They are looking at their options.

Brief discussion followed.

Kim Halstead, 7923 Cook Road, stated that when the side of M-72 was deteriorating, culverts and rocks were put in and it seemed to take care of the problem. Park Road could use it for the deterioration there.

Lee Bailey, 2897 Aero Park Drive, thanked the board for allowing him to speak and stated he would like to give the board some insight into the life of emergency services personnel. He

provided many details of daily activities. He stated it does not matter personally to him where the board goes with its decision. He encouraged the board to make the best possible decision for the people they serve.

Public Hearing

None

Reports/Presentations/Announcements/Comments

Grand Traverse County Sheriff Department Report – No one is present from the Sheriff Department.

County Board of Commissioners Report

Commissioner Carol Crawford gave the following report:

- Two weeks ago, the Board of Commissioners (BOC) voted to join the Michigan Public Safety Communication System and to purchase Motorola radios in order to improve radio coverage in the county from 71% to 99% or more.
- The Sheriff has asked for a full-time collections coordinator to replace the corrections officer currently performing this function. This was granted by the BOC.
- Tom Menzel from BATA has offered his services as a consultant for \$1 per month. The BOC has contracted with Menzel to move forward with their new budgeting process and improve the communications framework.
- Last week, the BOC approved the administrator job description. A wide net will be cast for qualified applicants.
- They have a results-based budgeting committee led by John Sych, Planning Director. He will also work with Menzel and Mike Mucha from the Government Finance Officers Association to begin the process.
- Crawford wished to clear up that the newspaper story describing that the county was proposing to build a building for MSU Extension and Commission on Aging is incorrect. They were given some options as to where these departments could be relocated, but they are not going to build a new building.

Brief discussion followed.

Fire Captain Report – No one is present from the Grand Traverse Rural Fire Department.

Ambulance Coordinator Report

Ambulance Coordinator Dawn Martin gave the following report:

- Regarding call volume, they had 17 runs in June. They have not missed any calls since February 1 of this year. The call volume is staying steady. From January to today, they are up 35 transports over last year. Seventy percent of the calls are BLS. As of today, they have had 107 calls and 68 transports.
- The last week has been tough on the team with some major calls. She stated she knows that whoever will take over will have a great team because she has a great team that serves the community. They also have a great auxiliary team who provides nutrition, water, etc. on extended calls.
- The EMS conference will be held on September 24-26 at the Grand Traverse Resort.

- The auxiliary BBQ is on July 20. The Board is invited. They always like to play softball.
- September 1 through December 21, MFR to EMT will be taking place.
- The last four days have been tough; they have persevered. She did not know Lee was going to speak. She gave hats off to her team and the other agencies.
- Martin provided each Board member with a copy of her resignation from the Ambulance Coordinator and Ambulance Privacy Officer positions, effective July 28, and stated it has been a wonderful opportunity. She thanked the community and the Board for the opportunity to serve.

Planning Commission Report

Lawson gave the following report:

- There was a special meeting on June 17. The PC discussed ways to record changes, i.e., recording secretary, zoning administrator, preferably one person. The PC is requesting that the new ZA start attending PC meetings and that he be paid for that. They discussed revising the land use application. There was a lot of discussion. General consensus was to redo it to include items that are currently not covered. The plan was that everyone would review the information and come to the next meeting with more input on the application. The PC discussed asking the Board if they would like to be part of the open house in August because of the types of questions that came up at the last open house.
- Lawson was not able to attend the July 1 meeting of the Planning Commission.

Brief discussion followed.

Parks & Recreation Advisory Committee Report

Goss mentioned that she attended part of last night's PRAC meeting. The Board's decision not to pursue the disc golf proposal at this time was discussed. Also, Goss informed the PRAC of the DNR inventory of grant-assisted properties that is due September 1. The PRAC would like to help with that process.

Consent Calendar

Receive and File

1. Supervisor's Report for June 2015
2. Clerk's Report for June 2015
3. Zoning Administrator's Report for June 2015 (none)
4. Fire Captain's June 2015 Activity Report (none)
5. Ambulance Coordinator's June 2015 Activity Report
6. Approved 05/06/2015 Planning Commission Minutes
7. Approved 05/13/2015 Historical Society Minutes
8. Approved 06/10/2015 Historical Society Minutes

Correspondence

1. Grand Traverse County Sheriff Department Statistics for June 2015 and 2nd Quarter Totals
2. Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board Approved Minutes of 05/20/2015 Regular Meeting
3. Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board Approved Minutes of 05/21/2015 Special Meeting

4. Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board DRAFT Minutes of 06/17/2015 Regular Meeting
5. Letter 06/19/2015 Charter Communications re: Channel Lineup

Minutes

1. Recommend approval of 06/01/2015 special meeting minutes and 06/09/2015 and 06/23/2015 regular meeting minutes

Bills for Approval

1. Approval of Alden State Bank vouchers # 39602 through 39750
2. Approval of Alden State Bank Miami Beach voucher # 1165

Budget Amendments (none)

Revenue & Expenditure Report (none)

Motion by Hubbell, seconded by Lawson, to approve Consent Calendar items as presented.

Popp noted that he has an issue with the Draft 06/17/2015 Grand Traverse Rural Fire Department minutes and would like to pull them out of the Consent Calendar. The issue is that they do not list how people voted on the roll call votes. He will object to them at the GTRFD meeting tomorrow night.

There was no further discussion of the Consent Calendar.

Roll call vote: Benak, yes; Goss, yes; Hubbell, yes; Lawson, yes; Popp, yes. Motion carried.

Unfinished Business

Review PRAC Master Recreation Plan

Goss commented that Melton mentioned last night that the PRAC believes they are 98% done with the Recreation Plan and will be getting it to the board soon.

Review Ordinance 22 Pension Plan

This agenda item was not discussed.

Review Whitewater Township Planning and Zoning Fees

This agenda item was not discussed.

New Business

Review Ambulance Service Proposals

Benak stated she has read both proposals and did a side-by-side comparison. Benak detailed some of the things she has questions on and described similarities and differences in the proposals.

Hubbell stated that it saddens him that not all of the board members got the proposals read because we knew this meeting was important and we need to get moving on this for financial reasons.

Hubbell listed the differences he found in the two proposals.

Benak questioned some of Frederic's financials.

Discussion followed concerning billing of insurance, billing of residents.

Holtcamp provided detail regarding MMR's charity care form and stated MMR does not automatically waive deductibles or copays.

Benak noted that if we were part of the Frederic group and we were traveling through an area they cover, they would write off the deductible.

Popp asked how do we get around how we sold the ambulance millage; we told the taxpayer they would not be billed.

Benak noted that the attorney advised us not to put that in the wording, because then the insurance companies stop paying ambulance bills.

Brief discussion followed.

Popp stated he came at it from an end user point of view. He questioned Holtcamp regarding how the dispatch center would operate.

Popp listed other concerns, i.e., Internet information he obtained, lack of defined preventative maintenance programs for vehicles and medical devices.

Holtcamp clarified MMR's vehicle repair program.

Popp noted the controversy over the dispatch center and stated he prefers to continue to use Grand Traverse Dispatch rather than outsource it as it makes it convenient for us to verify dispatch time, response time, etc.

Popp noted there is a big difference in the cost and in the vehicle program, but the largest is vehicle replacement.

Popp stated the Rural Fire partners and existing ambulance folks have worked so hard on cross training, and noted we, too, are thinking about cross training. Given Rural Fire's issues, will we be subcontracting the fire department in the near future? Popp is concerned that the cross training would be difficult to get back if it is let go.

Benak raised concerns concerning ambulance overtime expense, the burden of management, and lack of people during the day to cover calls.

Popp recited recent expenditure numbers for ambulance, which are increasing. Cross training is lost with outsourcing.

Discussion followed.

Goss stated she hopes no one came tonight thinking there was going to be a decision; she did not envision receiving the proposals on June 29th and having a final decision by July 14th. She envisioned each member of the board taking the time to read the proposals, formulate questions, have each of the companies back at separate meetings in order to get all questions answered, and then at a subsequent meeting the board would discuss, compare, deliberate, and decide. Goss stated she has read all of Frederic's proposal and composed questions, but has not yet read MMR's proposal. Both parties are here tonight. Goss stated she will ask her questions of Frederic tonight, if the board wishes, and will be ready to ask questions of MMR at the next meeting.

Brief discussion followed regarding how to move forward, with Popp noting that the Board has not discussed the process.

Goss proceeded to pose questions concerning the Frederic Township proposal to Deputy Chief Ed Goscicki, interspersed with questions from Benak. Goscicki answered the majority of the questions, deferring several to Chief Doug Pratt, who is not present.

Board discussion followed regarding expenditure and revenue numbers from 12/01/2014 through 07/06/2015, as well as how to proceed with the proposals. Hubbell and Goss would like this matter to be on each upcoming agenda until it is decided.

Goss also commented on cross training and the extraordinary amount of time which has been spent on getting the duty crew and on call shifts in place so that citizens could be assured of a response to every 911 call.

Hubbell stated it is hard to get volunteers and does not see how cross training would work.

Lawson stated the cross-trained people that were here are no longer here.

Popp stated they are here; they belong to Rural. None of the response issues were created by cross-trained personnel. We have a clean slate in front of us.

Goss noted the cross-trained people have other full-time jobs.

Hubbell stated he does not think the township needs to be in the ambulance business. He commends all the volunteers, but times have changed.

Consensus was reached that both ambulance services are invited/welcome to attend the next meeting on July 28th.

Tabled Items**Review Administrative Policy Section 5 (tabled 10/14/2014)**

This agenda item will remain tabled.

Review Graded Wage Scale (tabled 04/14/2015)

This agenda item will remain tabled.

Board Comments/Discussion

Popp noted that the Road Commission has given us another moving target. Popp has forwarded all emails from Jim Cook. Tonight we find out there is a different process.

Brief discussion followed.

Popp also noted that the County will use the surcharge money to purchase radios, when other townships received \$1.3 million in grants. It goes to show why Grand Traverse County is \$40 million in debt. Popp stated it is state law that you have a VHF radio in your ambulance, so we will have dual radios.

Announcements

The next Township Board meeting is July 28th.

Public Comment

Tim Shaffer, 5309 Moore Road, stated he apologizes to both ambulance services because he was under the understanding that there would be a decision tonight with regard to ambulance service. They were opened up two weeks ago. He then inquired of the board whether there will be a discount to residents on the ambulance services because they are paying the millage; do the fire and ambulance personnel get a discount. How will we pay for services; nothing has been brought up in regard to how the service is going to be paid compared to what we have already put out to residents. Regarding cross-training, most of the fire personnel are also EMT trained. MMR and Frederic would greatly appreciate cross-trained personnel in their service. Shaffer stated he is of the opinion that the board should have been ready to make a decision tonight instead of dragging it out another two weeks. The comment was made a couple times that the township needs to get out of the ambulance service. Shaffer stated from what he has seen tonight he agrees.

Matt Holtcamp, Mobile Medical Response, stated he commends the board; these are tough decisions. In the State of Michigan, there are 15 ambulance services that are currently going out of business. This is not a unique problem to Whitewater whatsoever. The board and the EMS service and Dawn Martin have not done anything wrong. It is the changing of the tides. Healthcare is a very difficult business right now. With the ICD-10 codes coming out, it is becoming extremely difficult to get reimbursed. Holtcamp stated he commends the board; he knows these are tough decisions; please do not take it personally. He stated MMR covers 6,000 square miles and 177 townships. Whoever the board picks, it will be the right one and it will be successful for the community. This is something that is happening all over the State of Michigan, not just Whitewater Township.

Adjournment

Motion by Lawson, seconded by Hubbell, to adjourn. Meeting adjourned at 9:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Cheryl A. Goss
Whitewater Township Clerk